



5.70

46422

143 Sigourney Street, Hartford, Conn.  
U.S.A. 31/1/21

My dear Goldziher,

I have not heard from you again lately but your book on Koranic legend has come and I must thank you for it and for all that I am learning from it. For I have not yet finished it, being greatly driven by teaching work. That work keeps me closely occupied with the Qur'an all the time but, so far as my pupils are concerned, in a simpler way and on a lower level than your book. And it also brings home to me our great need for such work as mine of a trustworthy translation of the Qur'an - I have just, by accident, come upon a perfect nest of errors in Palmer's translation of the beginning of ch. 1xv, and it is generally regarded as the best in English. It is such a pity that Fleischer's translation has not been printed.

You put Tabari's commentary higher, I think, than you used to do. I have been most struck with his diligence and power of classification. In Murtada' ay. Tabiri's comm. on the Thya (vol. iv, pp. 537 ff. and 555 ff.) there is an interesting classification of Qur'an commentaries. His ideal is Tabari. He had classified and weighed views, had paid attention to Prāb and to deductions. After him came copies

and subjectivity. Apparently M. has no appreciation of Zomakhshari's grammatical analysis and he does not seem to mention Bairdāwī, which is curious, in view of your note 2 in p. 124. But I will look at the passage again.

For my purposes as a schoolmaster in Arabic and in orthodoxy I find Bairdāwī admirable. In fact I think B. compiled his book for much my purposes, teaching Arabic and the Qur'an at once. He seems to think that Allah composed the Qur'an with the same object in view. For he remarks that perhaps  $\text{إ}$  is used in a certain passage in order to show that that was a philologically possible use of  $\text{إ}$  — or words to that effect.

I have just been writing for the Legden Encycl., the articles Kalām, Kalīng and Kalīng and I notice that you, on p. 174, regard Kalīng as "der Angeredele". I find that in the Ḥisān, xv, p. 428 foot, quoted from the Tahdhīb, but generally  $\text{كَلِيْنٌ} = \text{كَلِيْنٌ}$ . Yet I have not been able to find a statement or that equation in a grammarian although the commentators often refer to it. Can you give me any information on this?

Saunders writes me that he has written to you and sent you some copies of the articles about which you asked. I hope they have reached you.

With all good wishes from us both to you and yours and much sympathy with you in your present trials,  
Faithfully & Affectionately Yours,  
Duncan B. MacDonald.